

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCES OF MONGOLIA
HEALTH SCIENCES UNIVERSITY OF MONGOLIA

Copyright ©

TEMPA GYELTSHEN

**COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MONGOLIAN AND BHUTANESE CURRENT
TRADITIONAL MEDICAL SERVICES**

E 720400 Traditional Medicine

Thesis of Dissertation for Master Degree in Medical Sciences

Ulaanbaatar

2014

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCES OF MONGOLIA
HEALTH SCIENCES UNIVERSITY OF MONGOLIA

TEMPA GYELTSHEN

**COMPARATIVE STUDY OF MONGOLIAN AND BHUTANESE CURRENT
TRADITIONAL MEDICAL SERVICES**

Academic supervisor:

Ass. Professor D. Tsend-Ayush Ph.D

Academic consultant:

Ass. Professor G.Davaa Ph.D

Official opponent:

Professor Ch.Chimedragchaa Ph.D

Ulaanbaatar

2014

SUMMARY

Comparative Study of Mongolian and Bhutanese Current Traditional Medical Services

Introduction

In the two countries, Mongolia and Bhutan, the practice of traditional medicine is still widely spread. Although a vast difference in the culture, language, weather, environment, etc., is seen between these two countries, these two countries base the origin of their traditional Medicine practice on the four medical tantras prophesized by the Buddha of Medicine (Tibetan medicine). This somehow makes one curious about whether the services and other related things are similar too between these two countries.

Aim of the study

Thus, the main aim of this study is to compare and evaluate the Mongolian and Bhutanese current Traditional medical services and furthermore to investigate the current traditional medicine policy, regulation and human resource capacity, to find out the similarities and differences in the type of traditional medicine services, and to determine the perspective and satisfaction of both the traditional medicine professionals and patients.

Result and discussion

The policies pertaining to the traditional medicine of the two countries, was found to be quite similar. This similarity is mainly because the traditional medicine policies have been formulated keeping in mind the requirements of the World Health Organization (WHO) and the policies of the two countries also include the plans and programs of the WHO. The human capacity in the other hand consists of those who have qualified from institutes which have been recognized by the government in both the countries. But in Mongolia there were more traditional medicine institute including the private, in contrast to Bhutan there is only one traditional medicine institute. The duration for the training of the human capacity however differs between these two countries.

In terms of the services provided to the patients, a considerable difference has been found between the two countries. Services which were found in Mongolia were missing in Bhutan such as the exclusive in-patient services available in Mongolia. On the other hand, more pharmaceuticals were found in Mongolia including the private owned pharmaceuticals in contrast to Bhutan where there is only one pharmaceutical which is attached with the hospital.

This study revealed that in Mongolia 97% of the therapy available in Bhutan are also provided there where nasal irrigation is the only therapy which is not provided in Mongolia. In contrast, more therapies which are available in Mongolia are not available in Bhutan of which mud and physical therapy has been found to be non-existent ever in Bhutan. This study further revealed that acupuncture therapy was the most prevalent therapy in Mongolia while in Bhutan; the golden needle therapy was predominant among other therapies.

Majority of the physicians in both the countries gave their opinion that the facilities are still not up to the mark and leaves much more to be desired. 78.6% of the physicians in Mongolia and 60% of the physicians in Bhutan shared this opinion along with 45.5% of the patients in Bhutan who thinks that the facilities need to be improved.

Many services have been found to be provided to the patients in the hospitals of Mongolia and Bhutan by many qualified physicians. Majority of the physicians in both the countries were found to be satisfied with the service they provided which has been complemented by the view of many patients who were satisfied with the services provided and stated that the services were efficient and effective. Although opinions of satisfaction regarding the services were shared by both the physicians and the patients, they however feel that there is still need to improve the facilities that are currently present in the hospital which in turn will contribute to the productivity and efficiency of the hospital.

Conclusion

Though Bhutan and Mongolia are two distinct countries with different cultures, religions, values, development stage, etc., the origin of the traditional medicine practice is the same for both the countries. Although the origin is same, this study reveals the similarities and the differences regarding the traditional medicine policies, regulations, human capacity, services and the satisfaction level of the native people of the two respective countries.

Key words: *Traditional Medicine, Patients, Physicians, Mongolia, Bhutan, Hospital.*

CONTENT

LIST OF ABBREVIATION	5
LIST OF TABLES	6
LIST OF FIGURES	7
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	8
1.1. Background of the study	8
1.2. Significance of the study	9
1.3. Aim of the study	10
1.4. Objectives of the study	10
1.5. Research questions	10
1.6. Ethical considerations	10
1.7. Description of the dissertation	11
1.8. Presentation of the study	11
1.9. Publication of the study	12
CHAPTER 2. LITERATURE REVIEW	13
2.1. History of Mongolian traditional medicine	13
2.2. History of Bhutanese traditional medicine	14
2.3. Traditional medicine policy in Bhutan	15
2.4. Traditional medicine policy in Mongolia	17
2.5. Health legislation in Bhutan	19
2.6. Health legislation in Mongolia	20
2.7. Human resources in Bhutan	22
2.8. Human resources in Mongolia	23
2.9. Patient and physician satisfaction	25
CHAPTER 3. MATERIALS AND METHODS	26
3.1. Study design	26
3.2. Study area	26
3.3. Sampling design	26
3.4. Inclusion criteria	27
3.5. Exclusion criteria	27
3.6. Data collection methods	27
3.6.1. Review of documents	27
3.6.2. Observations	29
3.6.3. Interview using questionnaires	29

3.7. Question's validity and feasibility	29
3.8. Statistical analysis	30
CHAPTER 4. RESULTS	31
4.1. Traditional medicine policy, regulation and human resource in two countries	31
4.2.1. Traditional medicine general services in two countries	35
4.2.2. Traditional medicine therapy services in two countries	36
4.3. Perspective and satisfaction of traditional medicine physician's in two countries	40
4.4. Traditional medicine patient's perspective and satisfaction of two countries	49
CHAPTER 5. DISCUSSION	57
5.1. Traditional medicine policy, regulation and human resource	57
5.2. Similar and different types of traditional medicine services in two countries	58
5.3. Perspective and satisfaction of physicians and patients in two countries	61
CONCLUSION	65
RECOMMENDATION	66
REFERENCE	
APPENDEX	
A. Questionnaire for physician (Mongolian Version)	
B. Questionnaire for physician (English Version)	
C. Questionnaire for patient (Mongolian Version)	
D. Questionnaire for patient (English Version)	
E. Check list (Types of traditional medicine services)	

REFERENCES

1. S.Narayan, M.Aroonsri, R.Cheerawit and W.Somsak. Assessment of patient satisfaction at traditional medicine hospital in Nepal. ASEAN Institute for Health Development, Mahidol University, Thailand. Journal of Public Health and Development Vol. 10 No. 3 September - December 2012
2. World Health Organization Regional Office for the Western Pacific. The Regional Strategy for Traditional Medicine in the Western Pacific (2011–2020) 2012.
3. WHO. Global Atlas of Traditional Medicine, complementary and alternative medicine. Vol. 1. World Health Organization; 2005
4. World Health Organization. Legal Status of Traditional Medicine and Complementary/Alternative Medicine: A Worldwide Review. Geneva, Switzerland 2001
5. World Health Organization (WHO). Traditional Medicine. World Health Organization 2008. Available from: <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets> [Accessed 2012 Jan 8]
6. Sh.Bold. TMD, Ph.D., DSc (MD) Brief History and Development of Traditional Mongolian Medicine. Medical Research Institute, Ministry of Health, Mongolia.
7. Ministry of Health, The Medicines Act of the Kingdom of Bhutan (2003), Royal Government of Bhutan.
8. R.B.Adhikari. J.Tubadeza and R.Perez. Mongolia: Health and Social Protection. Evaluation study. Operation Evaluation Department. Asian Development Bank. Rapid Sector Assessment. October 2008.
9. Erdene P, Molor. Traditional Mongolian Medicine, Brief Introduction. School of traditional medicine. Health science university of Mongolia. 2012. (pp.4)
10. Z.Mensaikhan, U.Ligaa, B.Purewsuren. Current situation of Traditional Medicine in Mongolia. Country Report, 2010
11. Compiled in collaboration between WHO and Ministry of Health. Health Service Delivery Profile. Mongolia. 2012. (pp.3-6)
12. Jonathan Tae. Exploring Patient Healthcare Choice in Bhutan: Biomedical and Traditional Healing Practices. University of Cambridge, UK. 2010 (pp. 6&27)
13. Bhutan Health Management Information System, Annual Health Bulletin. Ministry of Health. Royal Government of Bhutan 2012. (pp. 105)
14. Kim Usher. Obtaining ethical clearance to conduct research: can the current situation be changed? School of Nursing, Midwifery and Nutrition, James Cook

- University, Cairns QLD. Contemporary Nurse March 2000, Vol. 9, No. 1: 3–5.[Citation](#) | [PDF \(1053 KB\)](#) | [PDF Plus \(891 KB\)](#)
15. Royal College of Nursing Research Society. Informed consent in health and social care research RCN guidance for nurses. Second edition 2011. Royal College of Nursing, 20 Cavendish Square, London, W1G 0RN
 16. WHO Library Cataloguing in-Publication Data, Medicinal Plants in Mongolia, World Health Organization Regional Office for the Western Pacific. (NLM Classification: QV 770 JM6) 2013
 17. C.Kletter, S.Glasl, T.Thalhammer, S.Narantuya, Traditional Mongolian Medicine - A Potential for Drug Discovery. Available online at www.scipharm. At March 30th 2008
 18. World Health Organization Regional Office for the Western Pacific. The Regional Strategy for Traditional Medicine in the Western Pacific (2011–2020) 2012. (pp.47,52)
 19. [A. Pitschmann](#), [S. Purevsuren](#), [A. Obmann](#), [D. Natsagdorj](#), [D. Gunbilig](#), [S. Narantuya](#), [Ch. Kletter](#), [S. Glasl](#) Traditional Mongolian Medicine: history and status quo. December 2013, Volume 12, [Issue 4](#), pp 943-959
 20. World Health Organization 2013. Mongolia Health System Review [Health Systems in Transition Vol. 3 No. 2 2013] ISBN 978 92 9061 609 2 (NLM Classification: : WA 540)
 21. Institute of Traditional Medicine services. An introduction to traditional medicine in Bhutan, second edition 2005. Ministry of Health. Royal Government of Bhutan.
 22. W. Dorji, Institute of Traditional Medicine Services, Men-jong So-rig Journal, National Institute of Traditional Medicine, Kawang Jangsa Thimphu, 2009: 1;158
 23. Dorji P. Traditional medicine system in Bhutan. In: Traditional medicine, better science, policy and services for health development: proceedings of a WHO International Symposium, Awaji Island, Hyogo Prefecture, Japan, 11–13 September 2000.
 24. Wangchuk D. Traditional medicine in Bhutan. Men-jong So-rig Journal, National Institute of Traditional Medicine, Kawang Jangsa Thimphu, 2008;1:89–108.
 25. World Health Organization. WHO country cooperation strategy Bhutan: Regional Office for South-East Asia. 2009-2013. (pp-12)
 26. Wangchuk P, Wangchuk D, &Aagaard-Hansen J. Traditional Bhutanese Medicine (gSo-ba Rig-pa): an Integrated Part of the Formal Health Care Services. Southeast Asian Journal of Tropical Medicine and Public Health. 2007; 38:161–167. [[PubMed](#)]
 27. Ministry of Health. National Health Policy. Royal Government of Bhutan. 2012.

28. The Kingdom of Bhutan. The constitution of the kingdom of Bhutan ISBN 99936-754-0-7 (pp-28)
29. Ministry of Health. Health services in Bhutan. A brief profile. Ministry of Health and Education, Health Division.
30. RGOB Bhutan 2020: A vision for Peace, Prosperity and Happiness, Planning Commission. Thimphu Bhutan. 1999
31. Bhutan Health Management Information System, Annual Health Bulletin. Ministry of Health. Royal Government of Bhutan 2013
32. Bernstein JA, Stibich MA, LeBaron S. Use of traditional medicine in Mongolia: a survey. Stanford University School of Medicine, USA.
33. WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data/ National policy on traditional medicine and regulation of herbal medicines: Report of a WHO global survey.
34. U.Karma, A.Sabina, Z.Tshoki, W.Wangdi. An Extensive Analysis of Gross National Happiness Index. Centre for Bhutan Studies, Thimphu Bhutan 2012.
35. R.Gonchigdorji, Health Situation, Statistical and Policy Reports, Health Act. 1998 Mongolia.
36. MoH, Health Sector Strategic Master Plan, Mongolia, Ministry of Health 2006-2015.
37. T.Tuya. Essential English for Students of Traditional Medicine. Health Science University of Mongolia, Ulaanbaatar 2009. (pp-118)
38. Donabedian A, The Quality of Care How Can It Be Assessed? The Journal of the American Medical Association, abstract 1988; 260 (12):1743-1748. Available from <http://jama.jamanetwork.com/article.aspx?articleid=374139>
39. Hawthorne G, Sansoni J, Hayes LM, Marosszeky N and Sansoni E, Measuring Patient Satisfaction with Incontinence Treatment 2006. Centre for Health Service Development, University of Wollongong and the Department of Psychiatry, University of Melbourne.
40. Hardy, G.E., West, M.A., and Hill, F. Components and Predictors of Patient Satisfaction. British Journal Of Health Psychology 1996. 1:65-85,
41. Sitzia, J. and Wood, N. Patient satisfaction: a review of issues and concepts. Soc. Sci. Med. 45(12):1829-1843, 1997.
42. Ware, J.E. and Hays, R.D. Methods for measuring patient satisfaction with specific medical encounters. Medical Care 1988.26(4):393-402,
43. Polit, D.F & Hungler, B.P. Nursing Research Principles and Methods. 4th Ed. Philadelphia: Lippincott. 1993
44. Julia Elisa Bereda. Traditional healing as a health care delivery system in a Transcultural society. MA Thesis, University of South Africa. 2002 (pp.11)

45. [Khayat K](#), [Salter B](#). Patient satisfaction surveys as a market research tool for general practices. Centre for Health Services Studies, University of Kent, Canterbury. [Br J Gen Pract](#).1994 May;44(382):215-9. [[PubMed](#)]
46. SurveyMonkey 1999-2012 [www.surveymonkey.com]
47. Microsoft Corporation, Sample Questionnaire 2013 [<http://www.samplequestionnaire.com>]
48. J.E. Ware, M.K. Snyder, W.R. Wright, Development and Validation of Scale to Measure Patient Satisfaction with medical care services, Vol. 1 part A. (NTIS Publ. No. PB 288-329)
49. S.Narayan, M.Aroonsri, R.Cheerawit and W.Somsak. Assessment of patient satisfaction at traditional medicine hospital in Nepal. ASEAN Institute for Health Development, Mahidol University, Thailand. Journal of Public Health and Development Vol. 10 No. 3 September - December 2012
50. Health Science University of Mongolia & Ministry of Health, Mongolia. "Quality and Safety of Health care at Mongolia. 2013 Report.
51. [Lhamo N](#), [Nebel S](#). Perceptions and attitudes of Bhutanese people on Sowa Rigpa, traditional Bhutanese medicine: a preliminary study from Thimphu. [J Ethnobiol Ethnomed](#). 2011 Jan 10;7:3. doi: 10.1186/1746-4269-7-3. [[PubMed](#)]
52. Men-Tsee-Khang. The Syllabus for Kachupa Degree Tibetan Medical & Astrological Course. Tibetan Medical & Astrological Institute of H.H. the Dalai Lama Gangchen Kyishong, Daramsala-176215 INDIA
53. Medical and Health Council, Bhutan Medical Council Regulations, (Revised 2010) Ministry of Health, Bhutan
54. <http://www.men-tsee-khang.org/college/inpatient.htm>
55. Wangdi, T. Bloodletting and cauterization in Bhutanese Traditional Medicine. National Institute of Traditional Medicine, Royal University of Bhutan. 2008.
56. Manila. Acupuncture and moxibustion for primary medical care: mission report in Ulaanbaatar, Mongolia, 14 June–14 July 1998. WHO Regional Office for the Western Pacific, 23 October 1998.
57. Donegan J, An observational study of patients, practitioners and practice in clinical settings offering traditional Mongolian medicine in Mongolia. Available from: http://www.chinese-medicine.co.uk/studying/msc_abstract.asp?id=61
58. Wangdue S. Herbal bath system in Bhutanese traditional medicine. National Institute of Traditional Medicine. Men-jong So-rig Journal. 2008;1:47–55.

59. Galay K. Chronic Diseases Prevalence Problem, Men-jong So-rig Journal 2008. National Institute of Traditional Medicine, Royal University of Bhutan 2008 (pp 21-31)
60. Lhamo N. Health Seeking Behaviour Related to SOWA RIGPA in Bhutan. National Institute of Traditional Medicine, Royal University of Bhutan. 25th May 2011
61. Wangdi, T & Gyeltshen, T. Diagnosis methods in traditional medicine. Men-jong So-rig Journal 2012. National Institute of Traditional Medicine, Royal University of Bhutan 2012 (pp 26-69)
62. Kim TH, Jung SY Mongolian traditional-style blood-letting therapy. J Altern Complement Med. 2013 Dec;19(12):921-4. doi: 10.1089/acm.2012.0752. Epub 2013 Jul 5. PMID: 23829811 [PubMed - in process]
63. Nidup D. The Result of Nasal Irrigation Treatment. Men-jong So-rig Journal. 2012;5:72-78. Ministry of Health, Bhutan
64. Baigalmaa R. Medical care needs and management issues of Mongolian Traditional Medicine. PhD Dissertation 2009. Health Science University of Mongolia
65. Zhao Q¹, Wu MZ, Zhao JP Chin J Integr Med. Heated moxibustion and bloodletting in Tibetan medical literature of Dunhuang Heritage. 2012 Mar;18(3):230-2. doi: 10.1007/s11655-012-1002-5. Epub 2012 Apr 2.
66. Ch. Chimedragchaa Folk remedy of Mongolia and developmental strategy of traditional knowledge, 2014.2.11
67. Narantuya.B, Oyuntsetseg.N, Chimedsuren.O, Purevjav.M, Assessment of National Traditional Medicine Policy and Strategy in the Context of “Regional Strategy for Traditional Medicine in the Western Pacific (2011-2020)” Survey Report. MoH Mongolia, School of Traditional Medicine and School of Public health, HSUM
68. Traditional Medicine Strategy 2002-2005, Geneva, World health Organization 2002 (WHO/EDM/TRM/2002.1)
69. National policy on traditional medicine and regulation of herbal medicines, report of a WHO global survey, Geneva, World Health Organization 2005
70. National Programme on Development of Mongolian traditional Medicine 2010-2018, Ministry of Health, Mongolia